

# ATTACHMENT 1

**CITIZENS' POLICE REVIEW BOARD  
MEETING OF THURSDAY, April 23, 2015 – 6:15 P.M.  
City Council Chambers - Third Floor**

I. CALL TO ORDER BY CHAIR SOKHOM MAO at 6:28 P.M.

II. ROLL CALL AND ATTENDANCE

Present: Chair Sokhom Mao  
Commissioner Paul Brisco  
Commissioner Chris Brown  
Commissioner Thomas Cameron  
Commissioner Howard Tevelson  
Commissioner Almaz Yihdego

Colin Bowen, Board Counsel

Anthony Finnell, Executive Director  
Patrick Caceres, CPRB Policy Analyst  
Karen Tom, CPRB Investigator  
Joan Saupe, CPRB Investigator

Absent: Commissioner Brian Bingham  
Vice-Chair Larisa Casillas  
Commissioner Derrick Muhammad  
Commissioner Jason Takenouchi  
Victoria Urbi, CPRB Investigator  
Nikki Greer, CPRB Investigator

III. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – ACTION ITEM

A. April 9, 2015

**A motion was made by Commissioner Tevelson to approve the April 9, 2015 minutes. Commissioner Brown seconded. The motion passed. The Board vote was 5-0-1, with Commissioner Cameron abstaining.**

IV. OPEN FORUM

Assata Olugbala came to speak. Ms. Olugbala spoke on the report regarding implementing discipline, which was released by the Monitor. She wanted to know what role the CPRB plays in all of the matters. CPRB is identified as being a part of the Stop Data Advisory Board and also part of the Racial Profiling Task Force – what has CPRB done as members of those groups. At some point, will the CPRB reflect to the community as a member of the Stop Data Advisory Board and the Racial Profiling Task

Force— what have you done and what has been the results of your work. She is very disappointed in what has been done in the work of police discipline, and is not going to take it for granted that everything is going alright - if we are going to do the work, we have to do the homework and the training. As a CPRB Board member, you have to be prepared to have the knowledge to reflect the decision making of a Board member.

Executive Director Finnell stated that he has not worked with the Racial Profiling Task Force. Director Finnell reported that he has worked on the Stop Data Task Force and has met with Dr. Eberhardt and provided her with information as she began to craft the course of the examination that she would do of the data. He stated that he does meet and communicate with her.

Commissioner Brown stated that he met once with the Stop Data Task Force – Professor Eberhardt.

## V. DIRECTOR'S REPORT

### A. Announcements

Director Finnell asked Board members to review Attachment 2 in the Agenda Meeting Packet. Mr. Finnell stated there is one addition to this report – we have completed the hiring process for the Office Assistant II position; we made an offer to our top candidate and she accepted the offer. Verdene Klasse has been working with the CPRB and she will be working in that capacity effective April 27, 2015.

Policy Analyst Patrick Caceres shared that as of today he accepted a position with the PUC in San Francisco as a Policy and Legislative Manager. He will be leaving the CPRB (last work day is May 14, 2015). He has been working with the Executive Director on a transition plan to ensure that the work he has done and the work that needs to be done in the capacity of Policy Analyst does not go undone for an extended period of time.

Mr. Caceres thanked many of the folks he encountered over the years. Mr. Caceres reported that he has worked for the City of Oakland for 10 years. He completed graduate school and then joined the CPRB as a Policy Analyst. Over those 10 years he has worked with multiple Board members, - Chairs and Vice-Chairs, committee leaders of the Board, various Directors, Board Counsels and Investigators. The City of Oakland has been a wonderful place for his career and personal growth. He stated that each and every day when he came to work, he always felt and thought like he made a difference in terms of making things better on a very important issue of citizens and police relations. He would like to thank everyone who he has been able to work with over the years; he thanked DC Downing – here tonight, special thanks to the colleagues of his, acknowledged Executive Director Anthony Finnell – he is in full confidence that the CPRB is under the great leadership of an individual that will bring it into a new era, with new resources, new authority, and a new commitment from the Council to be an effective organization to address these issues.

Chair Mao on behalf of the Board wished Mr. Caceres the best of luck in his new role in the City and County of San Francisco and said that it has been a pleasure working with him. Chair Mao stated that the Board will ensure that CPRB's work will be carried on by the next Policy Analyst.

B. Pending Cases as of April 16, 2015.

Director Finnell reported that as of April 23, 2015 there are 76 CPRB cases: 71 are active cases, 2 cases pending closure, 3 tolled cases, and 0 evidentiary hearing cases. Since the last report was given on April 9, 2015, four new cases have been added.

Chair Mao asked if there were questions regarding the pending case list. Commissioner Tevelson inquired as to Case No. 14-0533; the 3304 date be changed, combined with the case above it. Director Finnell stated that it will be corrected.

VI. AGENDA DISCUSSION

Assata Olugbala came to speak. Ms. Olugbala reported that as she read the independent 46-page report – there are number of sources which deal with police discipline of police officer misconduct, includes IAD, Criminal Investigative Division, Executive Force Review Board, the Chief, City Administrator, etc. All of this information, does it come back to you if you so desire to look at documentation relating to all those entities. She is concerned that too many No Findings of Complaints are the results of the investigations – and why is that happening. Some of the reasons could be the process of how we investigate, how the questions are presented, the comfort level of the individuals – people want to complain and they are not readily capable to speak to you because they feel retaliation; you have to have a method to get people to come into your space to give you what you need. I don't know why someone would not cooperate when they filed a complaint. The system has to work better. She did research on other Citizens' Police Review Boards (Florida has existed for 12 years) and there has never been a sustained complaint. It is being said that Citizens' Police Review Boards don't get results and she doesn't want this to be the case with this Board. What is the issue that we have so many No Findings as a result of people filing complaints?

Executive Director Finnell reported that an Investigator makes every effort to reach out to the individuals. Can we do better, yes we can and he is looking at ways to do improve. We send out letters, and individuals do not respond. On some of the complaints that we receive through IAD (they go to IAD first), many times those forms have outdated information. We are trying to address this issue by having all complaints handled by the CPRB office. When a person walks into the CPRB office with a complaint, we have an Investigator take a statement immediately.

Chair Mao announced that he will be on leave from the CPRB Board until September 2015.

Chair Mao stated that he will leave tonight's meeting early. **A motion was made by Chair Mao to nominate a member for Chair Pro Tem Pore for tonight's meeting (April 23, 2015). Commissioner Brown nominated Commissioner Tevelson and**

**Commissioner Tevelson accepted the nomination. It was seconded by Chair Mao. The Board voted unanimously.**

VII. UPDATE – CPRB STRATEGIC PLAN  
(Executive Director Anthony Finnell)

Chair Pro Tem Pore Tevelson will now chair tonight's Board meeting. Chair Pro Tem Pore Tevelson asked Board members to review Attachment 4 in the Agenda Meeting Packet and asked members to discuss/make a determination on Logo Options.

1. Logo

a. Discussion

Commissioner Brown suggested removing Option 2 from consideration.

Amend Option 3 with Community on top and on the bottom laterally will be OPD and CPRB.

Option 7 (was not included in the Agenda Meeting Packet but was introduced during the meeting by Commissioners Yihdego and Brisco).

Assata Olugbala spoke regarding the Options. Ms. Olugbala stated that the City of Oakland is not listed in the Options. She commented on the Options regarding the word "Trust" – not sure that this is the correct word, as a community member she is looking for justice, competency, equity – it could be a connection of several words that binds us all together. She envisions one circle divided equally, with all the entities.

Director Finnell thanked Ms. Olugbala for her comments. Director Finnell stated that this is an optic for the Strategic Plan; CPRB is not excluding anyone, we will work with all entities. Commissioner Yihdego reiterated that this Logo is not for the CPRB logo; it is for the Strategic Plan.

b. Action

**A motion was made by Commissioner Brown to remove Option 2. It was seconded by Commissioner Cameron. The Board voted unanimously.**

**A motion was made by Commissioner Brisco to accept Option 7 (which was not included in the Agenda Meeting Packet but was introduced during the meeting). It was seconded by Commissioner Cameron. The Board voted unanimously.**

## VIII. CPRB SPECIAL COMMITTEE REPORTS

### A. Outreach Planning

#### 1. General Updates

Commissioner Yihdego gave a report. She announced that she is working with the West Oakland Library to host an outreach event on May 20 or June 3, 2015. CPRB will have a table at the Juneteenth Celebration, June 27 (11 a.m. – 6:00 p.m.).

#### 2. Next Meeting

Commissioner Yihdego announced that the next meeting is May 4, 2015 at 6:00 p.m. (CPRB Office).

### B. Transparency and Legislation

#### 1. General Updates

Commissioner Brown gave a report. He stated that the Committee members are Commissioners Tevelson, Bingham, and Brown. There is one open position and Commissioner Brown asked Board members to call him if interested in being a committee member.

He stated that he resigned his position on the Outreach Committee in order to devote all his time to the Transparency and Legislation Committee.

#### 2. Next Meeting

April 29, 2015 (Conference Call at 11:00 a.m.).

The Committee decided that the majority of the meetings will be held via conference calls and emails.

## IX. CLOSED SESSION: NEW BUSINESS (Convened at 7:21 p.m.)

### A. Cases proposed for Administrative Closure / Pursuant to Ordinance No. 12454 C.M.S. section 6, paragraph G subsection 9, hearing would not facilitate the fact-finding process; and that no good cause is shown for further action.

#### 1. Based on findings of the investigation, No MOR violation

Case No. 14-0596, Ana Ponce (The case will be heard first in Closed Session)

- a. Complainant's Comment
- b. Staff Report
- c. Discussion
- d. Action

2. Based on findings of the investigation, lack of jurisdiction

Case No. 14-0414, Ausun Powell

- a. Complainant's Comment
- b. Staff Report
- c. Discussion
- d. Action

B. Pending Cases for Administrative Hearing Discussion

Discussion followed regarding the Agenda item.

C. Board Policy, Procedure, Bylaws Discussion

The Board reconvened open session at 8:08 p.m.

X. OPEN SESSION DISCLOSURE OF NON-CONFIDENTIAL CLOSED SESSION MATTERS.

BY MOTION AND VOTE IN OPEN SESSION, BOARD ELECTS EITHER TO DISCLOSE NONCONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION OR TO DISCLOSE CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION THAT THE MAJORITY DEEM TO BE IN THE PUBLIC INTEREST.

XI. ADJOURNMENT

The Board adjourned at 8:09 p.m.