

**CITY OF OAKLAND  
HOUSING, RESIDENTIAL RENT AND RELOCATION BOARD**

**Regular Meeting  
April 23, 2015  
7:00 p.m.  
City Hall, Hearing Room #1  
One Frank H. Ogawa Plaza, Oakland, CA**

MINUTES

1. CALL TO ORDER

The HRRRB was called to order at 7:10 p.m. by Board Chair, Edward Lai

2. ROLL CALL

MEMBER	STATUS	PRESENT	ABSENT	EXCUSED
Beverly Williams	Homeowner	X		
Edward Lai	Homeowner	X		
Benjamin Scott	Landlord	X		
Ramona Chang	Landlord	X		
Tyfahra Singleton	Tenant			X
Jessie Warner	Homeowner			X
Noah Frigault	Tenant	X		

Staff Present

Richard Illgen	Deputy City Attorney
Jessica Leavitt	Deputy City Attorney
Connie Taylor	Rent Adjustment Program Manager

3. CONSENT ITEMS

i. Approval of consent items:

R. Chang made motion to approve draft minutes for March 12, 2015, and draft decisions in cases: T14-0092; T14-0119; and T14-0128. E. Lai seconded.

The motion was approved by consensus.

4. NEW BUSINESS

i. Appeal Hearing in Consolidated cases:

- a. T14-0132; Richter v. Best Bay  
T14-0220; Carnegie v. Best Bay  
T14-0221; Garland v. Best Bay  
T14-0222; Domingeaux v. Best Bay

Appearances:

Tenant Representative

James Vann

Landlord Representative

Russ Taplin

Rebuttal

Both parties offered rebuttal.

Board Discussion

After Board discussion and questions to both parties, E. Lai made a motion to affirm the Hearing Officer's decision based upon the Hearing Officer's rationale. B. Scott seconded.

The motion was approved by consensus.

- b. T14-0020; Ramos et al v. Sonstein

Appearances:

Landlord Representative

Clifford Fried

Tenants

Albert Ramos  
Christopher Sheldon

Rebuttal

Both parties offered rebuttal.

Board Discussion

After discussion and questions to both parties, E. Lai made a motion to reverse the underlying decision due to error in the interpretation of Costa Hawkins law, and remand to the Hearing Officer to apply the provisions of the Costa Hawkins law. B. Williams seconded. The board voted as follows:

MEMBER	STATUS	AYE	NAY	ABSTAINED
Edward Lai	Homeowner	X		
Beverly Williams	Homeowner	X		
Benjamin Scott	Landlord	X		
Noah Frigault	Tenant		X	
Ramona Chang	Landlord	X		

The motion carried.

5. OPEN FORUM

Speakers:

- Eddie Ytuarte
- Susan Schacher
- Brian Geiser

6. OPEN FORUM (Item #5)

Speakers:

- Eddie Ytuarte
- James Vann
- Donna Warnock
- Brian Geiser
- Helen Duffy

The Board took a 10 minute break.

ROLL CALL

MEMBER	STATUS
Noah Frigault	Tenant
Benjamin Scott	Landlord
Beverly Williams	Homeowner
Edward Lai	Homeowner
Ramona Chang	Landlord

7. Old Business

- i. Discussion and Possible Action on Seismic Retrofits

## Discussion

Seismic retrofits will be placed back on the Board Agenda after an analysis is provided by Staff regarding the possible impact of different amortization periods on landlords and tenants.

- ii. Election of new officers

Election of new officers postponed to May 14, 2015 Board meeting.

## 8. SCHEDULING AND REPORTS

- 1. Panel meetings will be scheduled; e-mail will be sent asking for volunteers.

## 9. ADJOURNMENT

E. Lai made a motion to adjourn. B. Williams seconded. The meeting was adjourned by consensus at 9:30 p.m.